Introduction to International Human Rights Law

Pietro Pustorino

Introduction to International Human Rights Law





Pietro Pustorino Department of Law Luiss University Rome, Italy

ISBN 978-94-6265-562-1 ISBN 978-94-6265-563-8 (eBook) https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-6265-563-8

The fully revised text of this book is based on the translation of the book originally published in Italian: "Lezioni di tutela internazionale dei diritti umani" by Pietro Pustorino, © Cacucci Editore, Bari 2020. Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the author 2023

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE, part of Springer Nature.

The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

Foreword

In a relatively limited number of pages, this book offers a lot to the reader. In my view, the author is quite modest when he says in his preface that the volume provides a general introduction to international human rights law. In fact, there is more than that. In the following pages, the reader will find quite a complete, updated and critical picture of the *status* of the matter. This *fresco* is preceded by concise but extremely precise and well-documented elements and remarks on the historic evolution of human rights on the one hand and on their theoretical foundations and general characteristics on the other hand, two fundamental aspects for those willing to approach the topic of human rights not in a superficial way.

The scientific rigour of this work is not an obstacle to its invaluable merits as a didactic tool. I am quite well acquainted with the Italian version of this book, which is used by the students of the course on *International Protection of Human Rights* (*Tutela internazionale dei diritti umani*), the responsibility of which I have the privilege to share with Prof. Pustorino at the Law School (*Facoltà di giurisprudenza*) of the Luiss University in Rome, and I can witness to which extent it helps those—a huge majority—who are successful at the exams. Professor Pustorino and I are quite happy about the enthusiasm of our students, which is sizeable. Maybe a part of it is due to our efforts during the lessons and other personal contacts with the students, but I have no doubt that a large part of the merit belongs to the attractiveness and the reliability of the textbook.

The contents of the book are extremely rich. All the relevant areas are explored: customary international law, including jus cogens, international treaties, mechanisms—binding and non-binding—for the protection of human rights both at the universal and the at the regional levels, the domestic level, with great attention paid to the jurisprudence of national courts, which is undoubtedly an added value of this work.

The rights are presented in an original and extremely effective way, i.e. somewhat independently from the various sources in which they are enshrined. This does not mean that the sources are not considered. On the contrary, they are precisely and rigorously described, but this methodological approach permits a transversal look which is extremely valuable.

vi Foreword

In fact, this method permits to look at the extremely complex network of norms protecting human rights as an *ensemble* of communicating vessels. There can be no illusion—and Prof. Pustorino is extremely clear about that—that human rights could be the same for everybody in the world, but the fact all these norms aim at defending human dignity creates the premise for a mutual influence between norms and system which, at the end of the day, goes in the direction of a progressive better protection.

This is also valid when it comes to the relationship between the international and the national level, a dimension which is very much present throughout the book. Individual rights have been protected at a national level well before they become a concern for the international community, and an object of regulation by international law. There is obviously a risk that the national supervisory bodies, especially supreme and constitutional courts, see the international protection of human rights as a dangerous competitor and tend to oppose national solutions to the conclusions of international supervisory bodies. This is why when national supreme and constitutional courts show openness vis-à-vis the international law of human rights, this is to be saluted as a very happy development. I refer, in this connection, to an important judgement of the Italian Constitutional Court, judgment no. 388 of 1999. This is a very important decision. Before it, the case law of the Constitutional Court was firm in saying that the reference to fundamental rights contained in Article 2 of the Italian Constitution was confined to the rights already covered by the Constitution, i.e. a very nationalistic approach. In judgment no. 388, the Constitutional Court said, conversely, that the various international charters on human rights are relevant and that "the different formulas that express them integrate, complementing each other in their interpretation", which paved the way for a new season of the Italian constitutional jurisprudence, which has now a definite open orientation.

My last point would be joining Prof. Pustorino in his firm opinion that when it comes to the relationship between human rights and international law, one cannot speak of fragmentation of international law. International law of human rights is an integral part, and a very vital one, of general international law. I refer to his preface, which describes in detail the impact of the first on the latter.

It comes into my mind, in these sad days which are seeing the evil of war back in Europe, that at the end of the day international law is an instrument of peace, and this is particularly evident for the international law of human rights. So, spreading the knowledge on human rights law, as this book masterfully does, is also spreading the word of the peace.

Rome, Italy July 2022 Guido Raimondi
President of the Labour Section
of the Italian Supreme Court
of Cassation; Professor of International
Protection of Human Rights, Luiss
Guido Carli (Rome); Former Judge
and President of the European Court
of Human Rights (2010–2019)

Preface

This book provides a compact but general introduction to international human rights law. It is aimed primarily at undergraduate students, not just in law but also in any other programmes where the topic of human rights may be studied, including but not limited to political science and social science courses. But it could also be useful for consultation by scholars and practitioners in the fields of international law and human rights.

The book aspires to provide a complete depiction of the most important and current issues of the international protection of human rights. The theoretical foundations of the subject are analysed rapidly (Chaps. 1 and 2), as always with a concrete approach in terms of application of human rights theories or the general features of the legal framework (as in the case of both the relationship between universalism and relativism and the opposing conceptions of culture: see Chap. 2, Sects. 2.4— 2.5). Great attention is devoted to the practical and professional aspects concerning the application of human rights at both the universal (including the UN system: Chap. 5) and regional levels (Chaps. 3-4), and above all to the detailed analysis of the specific individual and collective human rights (Chaps. 6–12). The analysis of the specific human rights includes the rights which have recently arisen as a result of scientific advances in the field of biomedicine and biotechnology (medically assisted procreation, surrogacy, euthanasia, etc.), have been formed through a very extensive application of other fundamental rights (e.g. the right to hope: see Chap. 7, Sect. 7.3.1), or have arisen on the basis of the application of some rights to new pressing needs, as in the case of the application to climate change of the right to a healthy environment (Chap. 12, Sect. 12.4).

In regard to the concrete application of human rights, I considered it necessary to take into account not only the international law rules and case law but also some relevant national case law and non-binding decisions of human rights committees, especially in the UN context (including interesting cases in which national supreme courts applied non-binding decisions of these committees: see for instance Chap. 5, Sect. 5.2.6 with regard to a decision of the Committee on Enforced Disappearances). These decisions often integrate the international case law and sometimes even offer

viii Preface

new and courageous interpretations of fundamental human rights, with the aim of improving the general level of their protection.

A further objective of this book is to put the study of human rights in the more general context of international law. This is premised on the idea that international human rights law should not be considered as a legal environment autonomous from the broader system of international law. Rather, it is a regime that is fully integrated into the international legal order that, at the same time, has a very significant impact on it. This impact may be described as threefold. First, it concerns the structure of the international community: for instance, as regards the issue of international personality of natural persons (Chap. 13, Sect. 13.3) or the strong importance of minorities, indigenous peoples and multinational corporation in current international law (Chap. 13, Sects. 13.4–13.5). Second, it affects the content of many primary rules of contemporary international law, especially when human rights can collide with the principle of sovereignty of States: for instance, as regards the issues concerning the immunity of States and of state organs (Chap. 7, Sects. 7.6.1–7.6.2). Third, it has to do with the content of secondary rules of international law, thus in the context of the regime on the responsibility of States to which a specific part of the book is devoted (Chap. 14). Against this backdrop, the book frequently offers a comparison between what is provided by customary international law, what is established by special conventional regimes and what are the newest trends in international law.

I am deeply honoured that Prof. Guido Raimondi, former President of the European Court of Human Rights, has accepted to write the foreword of the book.

I would like to thank my colleagues Andrea Insolia, Manfredi Marciante and Pierfrancesco Rossi for their very useful suggestions on the structure and some contents of the book as well as for checking the case law references. Of course, I am solely responsible for any errors and omissions.

I also would like to thank Richard Boyce, who demonstrated great patience and competence in revising the English form of the book.

Rome, Italy July 2022 Pietro Pustorino

Contents

	to International Protection			
1.1	The Overcoming of the Domestic Jurisdiction of States			
1.2	The Origins of International Human Rights Law—The			
1.2	Protection of Foreigners			
1.3	The <i>Old</i> and <i>New</i> Holders of Foreigners' Rights			
1.4	Diplomatic Protection and Its Development			
	rences			
The	Theoretical Foundations and General Characteristics			
of H	of Human Rights			
2.1	Natural Law Theories			
2.2	The Theory of Social Consent			
2.3	The Positivist Approach			
2.4	Universality, Indivisibility and Inalienability of Human			
	Rights and Its Practical Implications			
	2.4.1 Universality			
	2.4.2 Indivisibility and Interdependency			
	2.4.3 Inalienability			
2.5	Universality Versus Relativism: The Necessity to Balance			
	Universality and Multiculturalism on Human Rights			
	2.5.1 Relativism and Opposing Conceptions of Cultures			
2.6	The New Perspective Based on Individual and Collective			
	Human Rights			
Refe	rences			
Inte	International Legal Sources on Human Rights: The Universal			
Leve	evel			
3.1	Jus Cogens and Customary International Law: Connections			
	and Overlapping between the Two Legal Sources			
3.2	Specific Features of the Peremptory Norms Regarding			
	Human Rights			

x Contents

	3.3	The General Principles of Law	32	
	3.4	International Treaties: An Overview	33	
	3.5	Particular Nature of Human Rights Treaties		
		Obligations—Limits to the Application of the General		
		Regime on the Law of Treaties	34	
	3.6	The Notion of Jurisdiction in Human Rights Treaties		
		and Their Extraterritorial Application	36	
		3.6.1 The Territorial or Spatial Control Criterion	37	
		3.6.2 The "Personal" Control Criterion	39	
		3.6.3 Extraterritorial or Indirect Application of Human		
		Rights Norms and the Expulsion of Individuals	42	
	3.7	Human Rights Treaties and Their Horizontal Application		
		(Drittwirkung)	42	
		3.7.1 State's Due Diligence and Domestic Violence	43	
	3.8	Human Rights Treaties and International Humanitarian Law	44	
	3.9	Derogation and Limitation Clauses in Human Rights		
		Treaties	46	
	3.10	Human Rights Treaties and National Implementation:		
		Domestic Rank, Direct Applicability and Direct		
		Effect—The Difference between Immediate		
		and Progressive Obligations	49	
	3.11	Soft Law	52	
	Refer	ences	53	
4	Inter	national Legal Sources on Human Rights: The Regional		
٠.		national Legal Sources on Human Rights. The Regional	55	
	4.1	The European Convention on Human Rights	55	
		and the European Court of Human Rights	55	
	4.2	Individual and Inter-State Applications to the ECtHR: The	55	
		Admissibility Conditions	59	
	4.3	Scrutiny by the ECtHR—Nature and Scope of ECtHR		
		Judgments and the Role of the Committee of Ministers	61	
		4.3.1 ECtHR General Measures	63	
		4.3.2 ECtHR Individual Measures	64	
		4.3.3 ECtHR "Warning" Judgments	64	
		4.3.4 Supervision of the Execution of Judgments	66	
	4.4		67	
	4.4	The Other Regional Human Rights Courts	67 67	
	4.4	The Other Regional Human Rights Courts	67 67	
	4.4	The Other Regional Human Rights Courts		
	4.4	The Other Regional Human Rights Courts	67	
		The Other Regional Human Rights Courts 4.4.1 The Inter-American Court of Human Rights 4.4.2 The African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights and the New African Court of Justice and Human Rights		
	4.4	The Other Regional Human Rights Courts 4.4.1 The Inter-American Court of Human Rights 4.4.2 The African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights and the New African Court of Justice and Human Rights The Arab and Asian Systems of Human Rights Protection	67 69	
		The Other Regional Human Rights Courts 4.4.1 The Inter-American Court of Human Rights 4.4.2 The African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights and the New African Court of Justice and Human Rights The Arab and Asian Systems of Human Rights Protection	67 69 70	

Contents xi

5	The	United Na	ations and Human Rights	73
	5.1		ntribution of the UN to the Development	
			nternational Protection of Human Rights	74
	5.2		nitoring Bodies Set Up in the UN Human Rights	
				75
		5.2.1	The Human Rights Committee	75
		5.2.2	The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural	
		0.2.2	Rights	7
		5.2.3	The Committee on the Elimination of Racial	
		3.2.3	Discrimination	79
		5.2.4	The Committee on the Elimination	,
		3.2.4	of Discrimination Against Women	8
		5.2.5	The Committee Against Torture	82
		5.2.6	The Committee on Enforced Disappearances	82
	5.3		le of the UN General Assembly, Economic	02
	5.5		ial Council and Human Rights Council	84
		5.3.1	The UNGA and ECOSOC	85
		5.3.2	The Human Rights Council	80 80
	5 A			00
	5.4		Security Council and Serious Violations of Human	0.
			-The Sanctions Against States	87
5.5 The UN Security Council and Individual				
			ns—Scrutiny of the Lawfulness of Targeted	0.0
			ns from a Human Rights Perspective	89
	5.6		Security Council and the International Criminal	0
		Court .		91
6	Indi	vidual and	d Collective Human Rights: Right to Life	95
	6.1		cation of Human Rights	95
	6.2		Life: General Scope and State Obligations	9
		6.2.1	Right to Life: Negative and Positive Obligations	
			of the State	98
		6.2.2	Extraterritorial or Indirect Application	
			of the International Rules on the Right	
			to Life—Relevance of Climate Change Issues	10
		6.2.3	Right to Life and Prohibition of Trafficking	10.
		0.2.0	of Human Organs	103
		6.2.4	Right to Life, Protection of the Unborn	10.
		0.2.1	and Abortion	103
		6.2.5	Right to Life and the Death Penalty	10.
	6.3		Life, Medically Assisted Procreation and Surrogacy	10.
	0.5	6.3.1	Medically Assisted Procreation	108
		6.3.2		110
		6.3.3	Surrogacy	
	6.4		Donation of Embryos and Scientific Research	111
	6.4	EHG-01-1	Life Issues: ECtHR Case Law	112

xii Contents

	6.5	The Rights Linked to the Right to Life—The Protection		
		of Human Dignity	114	
		6.5.1 Right to Health and Right to Access to Essential		
		Medical Services	115	
		6.5.2 Right to Food and Right to Water	116	
7	Othe	er Grave Breaches of Human Rights: Prohibition		
	of G	enocide, Prohibition of Torture and Inhuman		
	and	Degrading Punishment or Treatment, Prohibition		
		avery and Forced Labour and Prohibition of Racial		
		rimination and Apartheid	119	
	7.1	Prohibition of Genocide	120	
		7.1.1 Genocide Denial	122	
	7.2	Prohibition of Torture and Inhuman and Degrading		
		Treatment: Scope of the International Law Rules	124	
		7.2.1 Prohibition of Torture, Rape and Sexual Violence	127	
		7.2.2 Inhuman and Degrading Treatment and Detainees'		
		Conditions	128	
		7.2.3 Inhuman and Degrading Treatment		
		and End-of-Life Issues	130	
	7.3	Broad Interpretation of the Prohibition of Torture		
		and Inhuman and Degrading Treatment: The Formation	120	
		of New Rights	130	
	7.4	7.3.1 Right to Hope	131	
	7.4	Extraterritorial Application of the Norms on the Prohibition	122	
	7.5	of Torture and Principle of <i>Non-refoulement</i>	132	
	7.5	International Crimes and Universal Criminal Jurisdiction	134	
	7.6	International Crimes, State Immunity and Immunity	135	
		of State Organs	135	
		7.6.1 State Immunity	138	
	7.7	Prohibition of Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour	140	
	1.1	7.7.1 Human Trafficking and Prohibition of Slavery	140	
		7.7.2 Labour Exploitation, Slavery and Forced Labour	144	
	7.8	Prohibition of Racial Discrimination and Apartheid—Other	144	
	7.0	Forms of Discrimination	145	
	Refe	rences	149	
			117	
8		t to Liberty and Security, Right to a Fair Trial		
		Principle of No Punishment Without Law	151	
	8.1	Right to Liberty and Security, Enforced Disappearances		
		and Extraordinary Renditions	151	
		8.1.1 Enforced Disappearances and the Right to Truth	153	
		8.1.2 Extraordinary Renditions	155	
	0.2	8.1.3 Right to Liberty and Measures Against COVID-19	156	
	8.2	Right to a Fair Trial	157	

Contents xiii

		8.2.1	Right to a Fair Trial and Access to Justice	159
		8.2.2	Right to a Fair Trial and Other Linked Rights	160
	8.3	-	ole of Legality and of Non-retroactivity of Criminal	
				163
		8.3.1	Principle of Legality in Criminal Matters	166
			and International Crimes	166
9			pect for Private and Family Life, Freedom	
			Conscience and Religion, Freedom of Expression	1.60
			of Assembly and Association	169
	9.1	_	o Respect for Private and Family Life	170
		9.1.1	Notion of Private Life	171
		9.1.2	Notion of Family Life	174
		9.1.3	Right to Image, Reputation and Personal Identity	176
		9.1.4	Protection of Personal Data and the Right to Be	
			Forgotten	177
		9.1.5	Protection of Same-Sex Couples	179
	9.2		m of Thought, Conscience and Religion	181
		9.2.1	Islamic Veil	183
		9.2.2	Crucifix and Religious Ceremonies	184
		9.2.3	Post-mortem Examinations and Religious	
			Convictions	185
	9.3		m of Opinion and Expression	185
		9.3.1	Obligation of States and Horizontal Application	
			of Human Rights Norms on Freedom of Thought	188
		9.3.2	Freedom of Information and Protection of the Press	189
		9.3.3	Information Pluralism	191
		9.3.4	Right of Access to the Internet	193
	9.4		m of Assembly and Association	195
	9.5	Freedo	m of Movement	197
10	Refu	gees' Ri	ghts, Right to Citizenship and Other Political	
	Righ	ts		199
	10.1	Rights	of Refugees and Migrants	199
		10.1.1		203
	10.2	Right t	o Citizenship	204
		10.2.1	Deprivation of Citizenship and Its Limits	206
	10.3	Other I	Political Rights	208
11	Econ	omic, So	ocial and Cultural Rights	211
	11.1		o Property	211
	11.2	_	o Work	214
	11.3	_	o Education	218
	11.4		to Cultural Goods—The Principle of Common	
			ge of Mankind	220

xiv Contents

12	Right	t to Self-determination of Peoples, Right to Development	
	and I	Right to a Clean and Healthy Environment	223
	12.1	Right to Self-determination	223
	12.2	Right to Development and the Concept of Sustainable	
		Development	228
	12.3	Right to a Healthy Environment	229
	12.4	Protection of the Environment and Climate Change	231
	Refer	ences	233
13	Hum	an Rights, States and Non-state Actors	235
	13.1	States and International Organisations	235
	13.2	National Liberation Movements, Insurgents and Terrorist	
		Groups	237
	13.3	Natural Persons	240
	13.4	Minorities and Indigenous Peoples	242
		13.4.1 Minorities	242
		13.4.2 Indigenous and Tribal Peoples	245
		13.4.3 Indigenous Peoples, Use of Territory	
		and Protection of the Environment	248
	13.5	Multinational Corporations	250
		13.5.1 US Case Law	251
		13.5.2 UK, Canadian and Dutch Case Law	252
		13.5.3 MNCs and States' Responsibility	253
		13.5.4 MNCs and Individual Criminal Responsibility	254
	13.6	Non-governmental Organisations	256
14	Inter	national Responsibility of States for Violations of Human	
		ts	259
	14.1	Erga Omnes Nature of International Obligations on Human	
		Rights and Effects on State Responsibility	259
	14.2	Aggravated State Responsibility for Violations	
		of Peremptory Norms	261
	14.3	Developments Regarding the Individual Right	
		to Reparation for Serious Violations of Human Rights	263
	14.4	Individual and Collective Countermeasures for Serious	
		Violations of Human Rights	265
	14.5	Humanitarian Intervention and Responsibility to Protect	267
	Refer	ences	271
		Cases and Table of UN Treaty Bodies' Comments	252
and	Decis	ions	273
Rih	liogra	nhv	203

Abbreviations

ACHPR African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights of 27 June 1981 ACHR American Convention of Human Rights of 22 November 1969

ACommmHPR African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights

ACtHPRA African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights
ACtJHR African Court of Justice and Human Rights
ArCHR Arab Charter on Human Rights of 22 May 2004

ASEAN Association of South-East Asian Nations

AU African Union

CAT Committee against Torture

CED Committee on Enforced Disappearances

CESCR Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CFI Court of First Instance of the European Communities
CFREU Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union
CMCoE Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe

CoE Council of Europe

CommEDAW Committee on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination

against Women

CommERD Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

ECHR European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and

Fundamental Freedoms of 4 November 1950

ECJ European Court of Justice
ECommmHR Commission on Human Rights
ECOSOC Economic and Social Council

ECSR European Committee of Social Rights
ECtHR European Court of Human Rights

ESC European Social Charter of 18 October 1961 ESCrev European Social Charter revised of 3 May 1996

EU European Union

HRC Human Rights Committee HRCoun Human Rights Council

IACommHR Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

xvi Abbreviations

IACtHR Inter-American Court of Human Rights

ICC International Criminal Court

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights of 16

December 1966

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

of 16 December 1966

ICJ International Court of Justice

ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia

IHL International Humanitarian LawILC International Law CommissionILO International Labour Organization

ITLOS International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea

NGOs Non-Governmental Organizations
OAS Organization of American States
OAU Organization of African Unity

OECD Organization of Economic Co-operation and Development OSCE Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe

PCIJ Permanent Court of International Justice

SCSL Special Court for Sierra Leone
STL Special Tribunal for Lebanon
TEU Treaty on European Union

TFEU Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union

UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights of 10 December 1948

UN United Nations

UN Charter Charter of the United Nations

UNCommHR United Nations Commission on Human Rights

UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

UNGA General Assembly of the United Nations

UNHCR Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

UNSC Security Council of the United Nations
UNSG United Nations Secretary-General

UPR Universal Periodic Review

VCLT Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties of 23 May 1969